The International Electronic Journal of Rural and Remote Health Research, Education, Practice and Policy

MEDLINE listed 🧲

### PRELIMINARY REPORT

# Decision criteria in health professionals choosing a rural practice setting: development of the Careers in Rural Health Tracking Survey (CIRHTS)

D Schofield<sup>1</sup>, J Fuller<sup>1</sup>, S Fletcher<sup>1</sup>, H Birden<sup>1</sup>, S Page<sup>1</sup>, K Kostal<sup>2</sup>, S Wagner<sup>2</sup>, L Schultz<sup>2</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Northern Rivers University Department of Rural Health, Lismore, New South Wales,

*Australia*<sup>2</sup>Lismore Base Hospital, Lismore, New South Wales, Australia

Submitted: 6 October 2006; Resubmitted: 7 March 2007; Published: 17 July 2007

Schofield D, Fuller J, Fletcher S, Birden H, Page S, Kostal K, Wagner S, Schultz L

Decision criteria in health professionals choosing a rural practice setting: development of the Careers in Rural Health Tracking Survey (CIRHTS)

Rural and Remote Health 7: 666. (Online), 2007

Available from: http://www.rrh.org.au

### ABSTRACT

**Introduction:** Rural background and training have previously been found to increase the likelihood of rural practice. However, practitioners of many health professions remain in shortage in rural and remote Australia. This study builds on previous work in that it includes medical, nursing and allied health professions, considers the role of the health professional's family in employment decisions, and includes a broader array of factors influencing employment preference and the preferred location of practice. The survey also examines when students might work in a rural area.

**Method:** The survey was designed after an extensive review of relevant literature and existing surveys, consultation with rural clinicians, and piloting with students. Approximately 500 students per year are anticipated to complete the survey while on placement at the Northern Rivers University Department of Rural Health, New South Wales, Australia, and will be contacted annually for at least 10 years.

The International Electronic Journal of Rural and Remote Health Research, Education Practice and Policy



**Results:** The Careers in Rural Health Tracking Survey questions both students and their spouses about employment preferences and related family factors. It contains questions about the size of towns respondents would be willing to work in, and when they would consider working there. It also asks in which regions of Australia students and partners would be prepared to work.

**Conclusions:** This study aims to expand knowledge of the factors that encourage or discourage health professionals from practising in rural areas. Information about the time dimension in decision-making, areas most likely to face shortages, and about the types of clinicians most likely to work in certain regions, will be crucial when developing initiatives to attract new graduates to rural practice.

Key words: Australia, rural health careers, survey.

### Introduction

Limited access to health services remains a significant problem for people living in rural and remote areas of Australia<sup>1-4</sup>. This is in part due to difficulties in attracting and retaining health professionals to rural practice<sup>5-9</sup>. Schemes devised to improve the recruitment and retention of the rural health workforce<sup>1-3,5,10-14</sup> will only be successful over the long term if they address the issues that are important to health students in deciding to work in a rural or remote area, and target the students most likely to work in such areas<sup>3</sup>.

The literature has identified a number of factors which can influence clinicians in making location decisions, including rural background<sup>1,3,4-6,15-21</sup> or training<sup>1,3-5,15,17,20,22,23</sup>, spousal background<sup>1,17,19</sup>, sex<sup>1,5,24</sup>, specialisation, as well as the availability of professional support and continuing medical education<sup>3,6,9,16</sup>.

The current study is unique in that it includes all health disciplines, takes account of immediate and extended family factors that impact on employment preferences, and is longitudinal in design. It should enable researchers to follow student decisions about where they commence practice, when and if they practise in a rural area, and the association with factors that are a positive or negative influence on choosing to work in a rural area. It will examine factors that influence both recruitment, as students first move into the workforce and make their location choices, and retention as the new health professionals become settled in their career over time and make decisions to stay or leave their initial work location. This article takes a similar approach to that of DeWitt and her colleagues<sup>25</sup>, in that it describes the development and content of the survey tool.

### Method

The Careers in Rural Health Tracking Survey (CIRHTS) was developed following a review of relevant literature and existing surveys, consultation with rural clinicians, and piloting a draft instrument with students undergoing rural placements. Some questions (such as questions 13, 14, 17 and 21; Appendix) were taken or modified from previously published questionnaires in order to make the survey comparable with other data sources<sup>25, 26</sup>.

Approximately 500 students per year are anticipated to complete the survey while on rural placement at the Northern Rivers University Department of Rural Health, New South Wales, Australia. The placement experience can differ among disciplines, universities, and year of study. The CIRHTS, therefore, has the potential to examine the impact of repeated versus one-off, and early versus late exposure to rural practice, and the relationship between length of placement and rural uptake for different health professions.

Once recruited into the study, participants in each cohort will be followed for at least 10 years using an annual questionnaire. Cohorts will consist of students having a rural

The International Electronic Journal of Rural and Remote Health Research, Education Practice and Policy

placement in a given year, with students continuing to be recruited over the life of the study. Once in the workforce, in future waves of the study, participants will receive a modified version of the survey instrument, which will enable examination of changes in preferences over time, and will also gather information on their experiences as new health professionals, including both work and continuing education issues.

The questionnaire was completed and final ethics approval was received from the University of Sydney Human Research Ethics Committee in 2006.

### Results

The CIRHTS survey (Appendix I) questions students in detail on their personal characteristics, family relationships, education and current employment, employment preferences and factors influencing those preferences, and rural background (Fig 1). Because the decision to move to a rural area may also involve a partner or spouse, most items have space for both student and spouse responses.

Understanding the time dimension in a person's decisionmaking is crucial when developing initiatives to attract clinicians to rural practice. The CIRHTS is unique in that it asks students not only what size towns they would be willing to work in, but also when they might work there. For example, a student could indicate that they would work in a rural community within one year, a major urban centre within 5 years but never overseas.

While previous research has often distinguished only between rural and urban locations, pilot data for the current study suggested that the distinction is not so simple. It could be expected that when students consider practising in a 'rural area', their mental model of 'rural' is not defined as 'outside a capital city', but rather includes a variety of settings, some of which they would be willing to work in and others they would not. Thus, CIRHTS asks participants to nominate exactly which regions of Australia they would work in and, in so doing, attempts to define areas of Australia in terms of general desirability for practice location, to identify the types of clinicians who are motivated to work in particular regions, and to characterise the positive and negative factors that go into a decision to practise in one area versus another. Maps based on the Australian Bureau of Statistics' *Australian Standard Geographical Classification* of regions<sup>27</sup> are provided to assist students and partners in completing this section of the survey.

One important distinction among types of rural areas is the distinction between coastal and inland areas. With more Australians than ever before looking to live and work on the coast<sup>28</sup>, it is important to know whether this preference is equally reflected by young health professionals. Accordingly, CIRHTS identifies students for whom working near the coast is important, as well as those for whom it is not.

To ascertain the main drivers in student and partner location preferences, participants are asked to quantify on a Likert scale the extent to which certain factors would influence their decision to work in a rural area, from 'strongly discourage' to 'strongly encourage'. Space is also provided for respondents to name any factors that are not already listed.

### Conclusions

The CIRHTS has the potential to collect a great deal of information on medical, nursing, and allied health students' regional preferences, and the issues they consider important when considering rural practice. By collecting this information and tracking students over time, it should be possible to identify the specific factors, and respective weights of each factor, that determine whether an individual will be motivated to choose rural practice. This knowledge may be particularly useful for government and industry when developing new schemes so that they provide the greatest incentive for rural practice.



The International Electronic Journal of Rural and Remote Health Research, Education Practice and Policy



Figure 1: Components of respondent and spouse characteristics.

The International Electronic Journal of Rural and Remote Health Research, Education Practice and Policy



### Acknowledgments

The authors thank the student coordinators for their assistance in developing the survey and in keeping the project running: Vanessa O'Rourke and Shelley Hermann in Lismore, Jane Nichols in Grafton and Naree Hancock in Murwillumbah.

### References

1. Laven G, Beilby J, Wilkinson D, McElroy H. Factors associated with rural practice among Australian-trained general practitioners. *Medical Journal of Australia* 2003; **179:** 75-79.

2. Humphreys J, Jones J, Jones M, Hugo G, Bamford E, Taylor D. A critical review of rural medical workforce retention in Australia. *Australian Health Review* 2001; **24:** 91-102.

3. Rolfe IE, Person SA, O'Connell DL, Dickinson JA. Finding solutions to the rural doctor shortage: the roles of selection versus undergraduate medical education at Newcastle. *Australian and New Zealand Journal of Medicine* 1995; **25:** 512-517.

4. Hays RB, Nichols A, Wise A, Adkins P, Craig M, Mahoney M. Choosing a career in rural practice in Queensland. *Australian Journal of Rural Health* 1995; **3:** 171-174.

5. Wilkinson D, Laven G, Pratt N, Beilby J. Impact of undergraduate and postgraduate rural training, and medical school entry criteria on rural practice among Australian general practitioners: national study of 2414 doctors. *Medical Education* 2003; **37:** 809-814.

6. Shoo AM, Stagnitti KE, Mercer C, Dunbar J. A conceptual model for recruitment and retention: allied health workforce enhancement in Western Victoria, Australia. *Rural and Remote Health* **5:** 477. (Online) 2005. Available: www.rrh.org.au (Accessed 1 July 2006).

7. Richards HM, Farmer J, Selvaraj S. Sustaining the rural primary healthcare workforce: survey of healthcare professionals in the Scottish Highlands. *Rural and Remote Health* **5:** 365. (Online) 2005. Available: www.rrh.org.au (Accessed 1 July 2006).

8. Reamy J. Physician recruitment in rural Canada: programs in New Brunswick, Newfoundland, and Nova Scotia. *Journal of Rural Health* 1994; **10**: 131-136.

 Bushy A, Leipert B. Factors that influence students in choosing rural nursing practice: a pilot study. *Rural and Remote Health* 5: 387. (Online) 2005. Available: www.rrh.org.au (Accessed 1 July 2006).

10. Humphreys J, Hegney D, Lipscombe J, Gregory G, Chater B. Whither rural health? Reviewing a decade of progress in rural health. *Australian Journal of Rural Health* 2002; **10:** 2-14.

11. Adams M, Dollard J, Hollins J, Petkov J. Development of a questionnaire measuring student attitudes to working and living in rural areas. *Rural and Remote Health* **5:** 327. (Online) 2005. Available: www.rrh.org.au (Accessed 1 July 2006).

12. Jones JA, Humphreys JS, Adena MA. Rural GPs' ratings of initiatives designed to improve rural medical workforce recruitment and retention. *Rural and Remote Health* **4:** 314. (Online) 2004. Available: www.rrh.org.au (Accessed 1 July 2006).

13. Butler C, Sheppard L. The impact of undergraduate rural education on recently graduated physiotherapists. *Australian Journal of Physiotherapy* 1999; **45:** 23-30.

14. Hegney D, McCarthy A, Rogers-Clark C, Gorman D. Why nurses are attracted to rural and remote practice. *Australian Journal of Rural Health*2002; **10:** 178-186.

15. Eley D, Young L, Shrapnel M, Wilkinson D, Baker P, Hegney D. Medical students and rural general practitioners: congruent vies on the reality of recruitment into rural medicine. *Australian Journal of Rural Health* 2007; **15:** 12-20.

© D Schofield, J Fuller, S Fletcher, H Birden, S Page, K Kostal, S Wagner, L Schultz, 2007. A licence to publish this material has been given to ARHEN http://www.rrh.org.au 5

The International Electronic Journal of Rural and Remote Health Research, Education Practice and Policy

16. Heaney S, Tolhurst H, Baines S. Choosing to practice in rural dietetics. What factors influence that decision? *Australian Journal of Rural Health* 2004; **12**: 192-196.

17. Tolhurst HM, Adams J, Stewart SM. An exploration of when urban background medical students become interested in rural practice. *Rural and Remote Health* **6:** 452. (Online) 2006. Available: www.rrh.org.au (Accessed 1 July 2006).

18. Ward AM, Kamien M, Lopes DG. Medical career choice and practice location: early factors predicting course completion, career choice and practice location. *Medical Education* 2004; **38**: 239-248.

19. Rabinowitz HK, Diamond JJ, Hojat M, Hazelwood CE. Demographic, educational and economic factors related to recruitment and retention of physicians in rural Pennsylvania. *Journal of Rural Health* 1999; **15**: 212-218.

20. Woloschuk W, Tarrant M. Does rural education experience influence students' likelihood of rural practice? Impact of student background and gender. *Medical Education* 2002; **36**: 241-247.

21. Woloschuk W, Tarrant M. Do students from rural background engage in rural family practice more than their urban-raised peers? *Medical Education* 2004; **38:** 259-261.

22. Eley D, Baker P. Does recruitment lead to retention? Rural Clinical School training experiences and subsequent intern choices. *Rural and Remote Health* **6:** 511. (Online) 2006. Available: www.rrh.org.au (Accessed 1 July 2006).

23. Brooks RG, Walsh M, Mardon RE, Lewis M, Clawson A. The roles of nature and nurture in the recruitment and retention of primary care physicians in rural areas: a review of the literature. *Academic Medicine* 2002; **77**: 790-798.

24. Scammon DL, Williams SD, Li LB. Understanding physicians' decisions to practice in rural areas as a basis for developing recruitment and retention strategies. *Journal of Ambulatory Care Marketing* 1994; **5:** 85-100.

25. DeWitt DE, McLean R, Newbury J, Shannon S, Critchley J. Development of a common national questionnaire to evaluate student perceptions about the Australian Rural Clinical Schools Program. *Rural and Remote Health* **5:** 486. (Online) 2005. Available: www.rrh.org.au (Accessed 1 July 2006)

26. Committee of Deans of Australian Medical Schools (CDAMS). *Medical Schools Outcomes Database project 2005: Commencing Medical Students Questionnaire*. (Online) 2007. Available: http://www.medicaldeans.org.au/msod\_files/2005\_questionnaire.pd f (Accessed 7 January 2007).

27. Australian Bureau of Statistics. *Australian Standard Geographical Classification (ASGC), 2005.* ABS cat. no. 1216.0. Canberra: ABS, 2005.

Salt B. *The big shift*. Melbourne, VIC: Hardie Grant Publishing, 2005.



The International Electronic Journal of Rural and Remote Health Research, Education Practice and Policy

Appendix I Careers in Rural Health Tracking Survey (CIRHTS) survey instrument

# Career in Rural Health Tracking Survey (CIRHTS)

NORTHERN RIVERS University Department of Rural Health	Department of Rural Health Broken Hill
Northern Rivers University Department of Rural Health PO Box 3074 61 Uralba Street LISMORE NSW 2480 Pb: 02 6920 7570	Surname/ Family Name First/ Given Name
Fax: 02 6620 7270 Department of Rural Health Broken Hill Ph: 08 8080 1200 Fax: 08 8087 5240	Preferred Contact Details Please use BLOCK letters Street Address
r—A ssociate Professor 3. Hudson ation 5. Jocelyn Morris—Rural Director of Clinical Medicine. eloped in Collaboration with Senior ealth Service. / Coordinators.	Town/Suburb Post Code  Telephone Mobile  Email
Study Coordinators: ate Professor 2. Jeffrey Fuller Sue Page—Director of Educa ridinator. 6. David Game—D king (CIRHT) Study was dew from the North Coast Area He nformation contact the Study	Other Stable Contact Details ie: via parents Street Address

The International Electronic Journal of Rural and Remote Health Research, Education Practice and Policy

	<ol> <li>Deborah Schofield—A ssoc Birden—Senior Lecturer 4. Attachment Programs Co The Careers in Rural Health Tra clinicians For further</li> </ol>	Town/Suburb Telephone Email	Post Code Mobile
Fa	amily: We are interested in th	e relationship between Gender, F	amily Status and Career Preferences.
1.	What is your marital status?	Never married Widowed Divorced/Separated Married/De Facto	
2.	How many children do you have?	0 1 2 3 >3	
3.	Male or Female?	You Spouse/Partner Male Male Female Female	Child 1 Child 2 Child 3 Male Male Male Female Female Female
4.	What was the person's age last birthday?	You Spouse/Partner	Child 1 Child 2 Child 3
5.	Does this child attend Boarding School?		Yes Yes Yes No No

The International Electronic Journal of Rural and Remote Health Research, Education Practice and Policy

6.	Do you have shared custody of this child?			Ye No	o S	Yes	Yes No
7.	What is the person's ancestry? (what group do you identify with - tick up to 2)	Vou	Your Mother	Your Eather	Spouse/	Spouse's	s Spouse's
Australia	an/New Zealand				Partner	Mother	Father
Oceania North-w Southern North A South-E South-E Southern People o Sub-Sah	(includes Melanesian, Papuan, Micronesian, Polynesian) est European (includes British and Irish) n and Eastern European frican/Middle Eastern (includes Arab and Jewish) ast Asian (includes Vietnamese, Indonesian and Timorese) ast Asian (includes Chinese and Japanese) n and Central Asian f the Americas (includes US, Canada and Caribbean) aran Africa						
8.	Are you Aboriginal or Torres Strait Islander?	You Yes No	Spouse/Par Yes No	rtner Chilo	11 Ch Yes No	ild 2 o Yes No	Child 3 Yes No
9.	How far away do you live from your mother? (from your usual residential address)	You You S 1 2	Deceased <50 km 50-100 km 101-200 km 201-500 km >501 km	inniy iive.	Spouse/Pa Dec <50 50- 101 201 >50	artner ceased ) km 100 km -200 km -500 km )1 km	
10.	How far away do you live from your father? (from your usual residential address)	You	Deceased <50 km		Spouse/Pa Dec <50	artner xeased ) km	



The International Electronic Journal of Rural and Remote Health Research, Education Practice and Policy

More about you	50-100 km       50-100 km         101-200 km       101-200 km         201-500 km       201-500 km         >501 km       >501 km	
<ol> <li>Current Placement:</li> <li>Discipline (eg l</li> </ol>	Town State Medical, Physiotherapy)	
How long was 12. Current Studies:	/our placement? (weeks)	
Curre	Institution Instit	
Year yo 13. Admission/Entry Scheme: Please indicate if you are: (please select one response only)	I expect to complete       You       Spouse/Pa         Unbonded Commonwealth Supported (HECS) student       Image: Spouse/Pa       Image: Spouse/Pa         Medical Rural Bonded Scholarship (MRBS) student       Image: Spouse/Pa       Image: Spouse/Pa         Bonded Medical Places Scheme (BMPS) student       Image: Spouse/Pa       Image: Spouse/Pa         International student       Image: Spouse/Pa       Image: Spouse/Pa         Other (please specify)       Image: Spouse/Pa       Image: Spouse/Pa	rtner
14. Scholarship: Do you hold a scholarship?	No       You       Spouse/Pa         Yes, Medical Rural Bonded Scholarship       Image: Comparison of the second scholarship       Image: Comparison of the second scholarship         Yes, Rural Australian Medical Undergraduate Scholarship (RAMUS)       Image: Comparison of the second scholarship       Image: Comparison of the second scholarship         Yes, Other (please specify name of scholarship)       Image: Comparison of the second scholarship       Image: Comparison of the second scholarship	irmer

The International Electronic Journal of Rural and Remote Health Research, Education Practice and Policy

<ol><li>Other qualifications:</li></ol>	You	Spouse/Partner
Name of Qualification		
Year Commenced		
Year Completed		
Name of Qualification		
Year Commenced		
Year Completed		
16. Current Employment (main job)?	You	Spouse/Partner
See Attachment 1 (enter 4 Digit Code)		
Usual No. hours worked pw		
Town		
State		
Postcode		
Country		
We would like to know more about w	here you grew up and where you	would like to work in the future.
17. I regard myself as being from the following background:	You Capital City or major urban centre (>100,000) Regional City or Large town (25,000-100,000) Smaller town (10,000-24,999) Small rural community (<10,000)	Spouse/Partner         Capital City or major urban centre (>100,000)         Regional City or Large town (25,000-100,000)         Smaller town (10,000-24,999)         Small rural community (<10,000)
18. Did you complete high school in Australia?	You Yes (go to Question 19)	Spouse/Partner Yes (go to Question 19)



The International Electronic Journal of Rural and Remote Health Research, Education Practice and Policy

### Appendix I – cont'd

	No (go to Question 21)	No (go to Question 21)
<ol> <li>Number of years of secondary schooling in Australia outside of a capital city or major urban area: Gosford-Wyong, Newcastle, Wollongong, Queanbeyan, Blue Mountains, Geelong, Gold Coast- Tweed Heads, Townsville.</li> </ol>	You Years	Spouse/Partner Years
20. Name and postcode of secondary school for your final year?	You	Spouse/Partner

21. Would you and your spouse be happy to work in towns of the following size and when? (please circle)



- 22a. In the list below, tick ( $\sqrt{}$ ) the areas in which you and your spouse would be happy to work <u>in the future</u>
  - b. Also, please circle () the area in which you <u>currently live</u>. Refer to Attachment 2 for area maps.



The International Electronic Journal of Rural and Remote Health Research, Education Practice and Policy

#### Appendix I - cont'd



23. How satisfied are you with where you are currently living?



The International Electronic Journal of Rural and Remote Health Research, Education Practice and Policy

#### Appendix I – cont'd



26. To what extent would each of the following factors influence your choice and that of your spouse/partner (if applicable) to work in a rural area? (please circle)

Key:	-2=	Strongly	/ Disco	ourage	-1= SI	lightly Discourage	0 = Neutral	+1 = Slightly	y Encou	age	+2 = St	rongly E	ncourage
	You								Spous	e/Par	tner		
	-2	-1	0	+1	+2	Living	Close to Fam	ily	-2	1	0	+1	+2
	-2	-1	0	+1	+2	Living	Living close to friends			-1	0	+1	+2
	-2	-1	0	+1	+2	Rural	lifestyle/cultu	re	-2	-1	0	+1	+2
	-2	-1	0	+1	+2	C	ost of living		-2	-1	0	+1	+2
	-2	-1	0	+1	+2	Cost of	f accommodati	on	-2	-1	0	+1	+2
	-2	-1	0	+1	+2	Lack o	f public transp	ort	-2	-1	0	+1	+2
	-2	-1	0	+1	+2	Care	er opportunitie	s	-2	-1	0	+1	+2
	-2	-1	0	+1	+2	R	emuneration		-2	-1	0	+1	+2
	-2	-1	0	+1	+2		Workload		-2	-1	0	+1	+2
	-2	-1	0	+1	+2	Т	ype of work		-2	-1	0	+1	+2
	-2	-1	0	+1	+2	Environme	nt for raising c	hildren	-2	-1	0	+1	+2
	-2	-1	0	+1	+2	Access to childre	en (custodial ar	rangements)	-2	-1	0	+1	+2
	-2	-1	0	+1	+2	Bonding/other co	ntracting work	c requirement	-2	-1	0	+1	+2
	-2	-1	0	+1	+2	Desire to help p	eople in rural/r	remote areas	-2	-1	0	+1	+2
	-2	-1	0	+1	+2		Challenge		-2	-1	0	+1	+2
	-2	-1	0	+1	+2	Familia	rity with rural	area	-2	-1	0	+1	+2
	-2	-1	0	+1	+2	My curre	ent rural places	ment	-2	-1	0	+1	+2
	-2	-1	0	+1	+2	Previous	s rural placem	ents	-2	-1	0	+1	+2
	-2	-1	0	+1	+2	Other (pl	ease specify u	nder)	-2	-1	0	+1	+2
	-2	-1	0	+1	+2	Other (pl	ease specify w	nder)	-2	-1	0	+1	+2
27. in a f	Wou	ld you   group?	be pre	pared t	o take j	part	Yes						6

The International Electronic Journal of Rural and Remote Health Research, Education Practice and Policy

#### Appendix I – cont'd



Modified on 8 January 2008: A sentence has been added to the Method section: 'Some questions (such as questions 13, 14, 17 and 21; Appendix) were taken or modified from previously published questionnaires in order to make the survey comparable with other data sources<sup>25, 26</sup>.' In addition, an additional reference has been inserted into the reference list as reference 26.

